

8-2019

A Salvation Army Commencement Narrative: An Investigation of Literature Focused on the Army in Queensland

Garth Hentzschel

Avondale College of Higher Education, s17050307@student.avondale.edu.au

Daniel Reynaud

Avondale College of Higher Education, daniel.reynaud@avondale.edu.au

Wendy Jackson

Avondale College of Higher Education, wendy.jackson@avondale.edu.au

Follow this and additional works at: https://research.avondale.edu.au/arts_papers



Part of the [Arts and Humanities Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Hentzschel, G. R., Reynaud, D., & Jackson, W. (2019). A Salvation Army commencement narrative: An investigation of the literature focused on the Army in Queensland. *The Australasian Journal of Salvation Army History*, 4(2), 15-26.

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty of Humanities and Creative Arts at ResearchOnline@Avondale. It has been accepted for inclusion in Arts Papers and Journal Articles by an authorized administrator of ResearchOnline@Avondale. For more information, please contact alicia.starr@avondale.edu.au.

A SALVATION ARMY COMMENCEMENT NARRATIVE: AN INVESTIGATION OF LITERATURE FOCUSED ON THE ARMY IN QUEENSLAND

Garth R. Hentzschel, Daniel Reynaud and Wendy Jackson

Introduction

Much of the existing literature surrounding the broader Salvation Army Australian commencement narrative is Adelaide centric. While the Army adheres to June 1885 as the ‘official’ date for its beginning in Queensland, there are hints of earlier work; authors even stated that some earlier attempts were official. This paper will investigate the existing literature focused on The Salvation Army Queensland commencement narrative. The paper will begin by discussing the current wider narrative and then give a chronological discussion of the available literature focused on Queensland. Entwined with the latter discussion, will be an investigation of the possible sources used. This investigation found that the existing narrative is not always clear, holds conflicting accounts, and is full of assumptions that are unsupported by sources. To conclude, the paper will discuss the weaknesses and gaps of the current Queensland commencement narrative. The literature was collected across three Salvation Army heritage centres¹ for the confirmation process of the Doctor of Philosophy program within Avondale College, New South Wales, Australia.

The Salvation Army commencement narrative on the Australian continent

Lowell Tarling and Hubert Scotney stated, for Australia, 1880 was a “year of multiple births”,² as expressions of Army ministry appeared in Sydney, Melbourne, Adelaide and Brisbane. Yet, the vast majority of historical narratives of The Salvation Army commencement in Australia, almost always begin with Adelaide, South Australia.³

The traditional commencement narrative chronicles, in brief, that early in 1880 a revivalist, Matthew Burnett conducted a six-week campaign in Adelaide. Two Salvationist immigrants from England, Edward Saunders and John Gore, met after one of Burnett’s meetings. This connection led them to write to General William Booth, in May of that year, to request an officer be sent. By August, Gore and Saunders had rented the Labour League Hall and on Sunday 5 September 1880 held an open-air meeting commencing the Army in South Australia.⁴ Captain Thomas and Mrs. Adelaide Sutherland arrived in Adelaide on 17 February 1881. Both the September and February dates are used

Reference citation of this paper; Garth R. Hentzschel, Daniel Reynaud and Wendy Jackson, “A Salvation Army commencement narrative: An investigation of literature focused on the Army in Queensland”, *The Australasian Journal of Salvation Army History*, 4, 2, 2019, 15 – 26.

¹ The search for literature took place at The Salvation Army Heritage Centre, Sydney (with assistance of Envoy Dr. George Hazell OF and Robyn Edge); The Salvation Army Heritage Centre, Melbourne (with the assistance of Lindsay Cox and Major Donna Bryan); and The Salvation Army International Heritage Centre, London (with assistance of Steven Spencer).

² Lowell Tarling, *Thank God for the Salvos: The Salvation Army in Australia, 1880 – 1980*, (Artarmon, Australia: Harper & Row, 1980). 16.; Hubert Scotney, “The Year of Multiple Births”, *The officer*, (UK: Vol. 30, No. 3, March 1979), 101 – 104.

³ See for example Barbara Bolton, *Booth’s drum – The Salvation Army in Australia 1880-1980*, (Australia: Hodder and Stoughton, 1980).; Robert Sandall, *The history of The Salvation Army, Volume two, 1878 – 1886*, (London, UK: Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1950), 2:243 – 245.

⁴ Sandall, *The history of The Salvation Army*, 2:243 – 245.

OUR QUEENSLAND EXPEDITION



**STAFF-OFFICER EDWARDS. ADJUTANT WRIGHT. CAPTAIN BOWERMAN. MRS. WRIGHT
THE GROUP OF OFFICERS WHO ARRIVED IN BRISBANE IN JUNE 1885⁵**

⁵ “Our Queensland expedition”, *The war cry*, (Melbourne, Saturday 4 July 1885), 1.

as dates on which Australian Salvationist and international literature claim to be the commencement of the movement in Australia.⁶ On 10 August 1882, Booth conducted the marriage of, and appointed with the rank of Major, James Barker and Alice Sutton to Australia, “to represent headquarters in the whole of the Colonies of the Southern Sea.”⁷ From this, the traditional commencement narrative claimed, there was a seamless expansion from South Australia to other colonies throughout Australasia.⁸

Such a narrative ignores a number of important developmental factors of the movement and the context in which it was situated. Firstly, as expressed by Helen Cox and Jennifer Hein, there was no country called Australia at the time of the commencement of the Army. Therefore, this narrative fails to understand the complexities of the relationships between the colonies and their citizens.⁹ Secondly, this narrative fails to address human weaknesses that led to schisms and disagreements.¹⁰ Thirdly, it must be noted that Robert Sandall, in the official history of The Salvation Army, failed to discuss the commencement of the Army in Western Australia and Tasmania. In a similar criticism, Hein lamented that, after the narrative of Gore, Saunders and Sutherland in Adelaide, Army histories have, to a point, neglected South Australia with the focus shifting to Melbourne and Sydney.¹¹ Therefore the narrative is narrow in focus and ignores the complexities of the movement’s growth, development and sustainability across the continent. Fourthly, it eliminates other commencement narratives, or as Tarling and Scotney described, the other “births”.¹² It is this fourth point that the paper will investigate, and while it is acknowledged that other centres were listed, for brevity and connection with ongoing research the focus here will be on Queensland.

The current Salvation Army Queensland commencement narrative

The official international history of The Salvation Army indicated that there were attempts to commence The Salvation Army in Queensland prior to 1885. Sandall wrote:

Attempts to establish corps in Queensland, official and unofficial, failed until Adjutant and Mrs. Edward Wright, Staff-Officer Reuben Edwards and Captain Bowerman began meetings in Brisbane in June 1885 in the Academy of Music. An iron hall in Charlotte Street bearing the name “The Salvation Army,” a relic of previous attempts to start operations in Brisbane, was used for week-night meetings...¹³

⁶ It is acknowledged that the date is now a contentious issue, some have stated the September 1880 date due to one of Gore and Saunders open-air meetings, others stated February 1881 with the arrival of an officer, yet others stated August 1882 with the arrival of Barker to set up headquarters. It is not the intention of this paper to discuss this complex matter.

⁷ Sandall, *The history of The Salvation Army*, 2:247.

⁸ Sandall, *The history of The Salvation Army*, 2:243 – 253.

⁹ Helen Cox, *Defining the war: Salvation Army social-welfare participation in Australia 1881 – 1902*, (Melbourne, Australia: Unpublished dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, The University of Melbourne, December 2011).; Jennifer Hein, *‘Abominable yahoos’: Exploring the historical memory of the beginning of the Salvation Army in South Australia*, (Adelaide, Australia: Unpublished dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, Flinders University, 2014).

¹⁰ See Hein, *‘Abominable yahoos’*; Jennifer Hein, “A crisis of leadership: John Alexander Dowie and the Salvation Army”, *Journal of the Historical Society of South Australia*, (Adelaide, Australia: No. 39, 2011), 65 – 77.; Garth R. Hentzschel, “Hidden turmoil of Army’s early days”, *Pipeline*, (Sydney, Australia: The Salvation Army Australia Eastern Territory, Vol. 17, Iss. 10, October 2013), 26 – 28.

¹¹ Sandall, *The history of The Salvation Army*, 2:243 – 253.; Hein, *‘Abominable yahoos’*.

¹² Tarling, *Thank God for the Salvos.*; Scotney, “The Year of Multiple Births”.

¹³ Sandall, *The history of The Salvation Army*, 2:249.

Sandall gave only a very brief account of the birth of the movement in Queensland, that there were attempts and that these attempts had left a “relic”, “[a]n iron hall in Charlotte Street”. Who these people were and when the attempts were made was not discussed. In addition to this, Sandall did not define what was meant by “official and unofficial”, nor has this been defined in other sources.¹⁴ Sandall was however not the first to write about the commencement narrative of Queensland and most certainly would have borrowed from the earlier writing.

The first identified article in the chronology of The Salvation Army Queensland commencement narrative, prior to June 1885, appeared with the newly published periodical, *The musician*. Earlier works either listed nothing of Queensland,¹⁵ or only the work of the Army in Queensland from June 1885.¹⁶ The following investigation will focus on documents that list some Army activity in Queensland prior to the June 1885 date. As will be seen, most literature related to the Queensland commencement narrative outlined similar ideas to Sandall’s. Also, because, like Sandall, all except two publications do not reference sources, this paper has attempted to reveal this information.

Chronology of The Salvation Army Queensland commencement narrative

In what would appear to be the preparative work for his later book, *Salvation Chariot*,¹⁷ Percival Dale published a series of articles in 1947 in the Army newspaper, *The musician*. The series was titled “Echoes from yesterday” and each was about the history of the Army in a specific location. Of interest to this investigation was his first article which focused on the Queensland commencement narrative.¹⁸

¹⁴ Salvation Army international publications such as *All the world* and *The year book of The Salvation Army* used different dates to denote ‘official’ commencements within the one country. In reviewing literature, it was found that there was no singular rule of the ‘official’ commencement, it could have been the first; indoor meeting, open-air meeting, soldier arriving, visit by a Salvationist, officer appointed, officer arrival, flag hoisted, arrival of a senior officer, approved by IHQ, etc. Murdoch claimed that in his investigations, “only when it was successful did the Army count this as the beginning”. Norman Murdoch, “Professor Norman Murdoch addresses Historical Society.” *Under the tricolour*, (Sydney, No. 26, November, 2005), 8.

¹⁵ See for example, Authority of the General, *Outlines of Salvation Army history*, (London, UK: Salvationist Publishing and Supplies, 1927), 40 - 41.; F. De L. Booth-Tucker, *The life of Catherine Booth mother of The Salvation Army*, 3 volumes, (London, UK: International Headquarters of The Salvation Army, 1893), 2:207.; Catherine Bramwell-Booth, *Bramwell Booth*, (London, UK: Rich & Cowan, 1933), 174.; Frederick Booth-Tucker, *William Booth, The general of The Salvation Army*, (London, UK: The Salvation Army, 1898), 58.; Charles T. Bateman, *Everybody’s life of General Booth*, (London, UK: Marshall Brothers, n.d.), 48 – 49.; Minnie Carpenter, *Commissioner Henry Howard*, (London, UK: Salvationists Publishing & Supplies, 1926), 34 – 52.

¹⁶ See for example, Anon, “Landmarks in history, Rapid review of The Salvation Army in Australia”, *The war cry*, (Melbourne, 10 November 1934), 3.; Anon, “‘Army’ commissioner here for 70th year”, *Telegraph*, (Brisbane, 3 April 1955), 13.; Anon, *A brief history of The Salvation Army in Australia*, (Sydney: The Salvation Army, Eastern Australia Territory News and information service, 1980).; Simone Worthing, “Army celebrates 125 years in Queensland”, *Pipeline*, (Sydney, January 2011), 13. A song by Major Tom Hubbard outlined the commencement in Adelaide and then each colony. For Queensland the verse assumed that there had never been earlier commencements as it stated;

In July of ’85,
Brisbane streets became alive
With the sounds and fury of Salvation war.
As, with Adjutant Ted Wright
In command, they took to flight
Into places it had never been before.

T. Hubbard, “With the conquering Son of God”, (Sydney, c1980).

¹⁷ Percival Dale, *Salvation chariot*, (East Melbourne, Australia: The Salvation Army Press, 1952).

¹⁸ Percival Dale, “Hectic opening days in Queensland”, in the series “Echoes from yesterday”, *The musician*, (Melbourne, Vol. 1, No. 1, September 1947), 16.

The article outlined three attempts to commence the Army in Queensland and also, in his mind, the only successful attempt in June 1885. The three attempts were by McNaught in 1880; Cairns in 1882 and Harry in 1883. Each of these, he claimed without support, was unsuccessful. As no sources were cited, an investigation revealed the sources used.

In Dale's article, a July 1885 report from *The Brisbane courier* was used for the introduction, and was also partially copied in a large textbox at its centre.¹⁹ The textbox quotation did not use the report's original title, "A Salvation 'free-and-easy'"; Dale created his own, "In Nebuchadnezzar's Furnace".²⁰ Dale's title would later be used in other publications, wrongly inferring that it was the original 'pet name' for the building used by Salvationists in the earlier attempts.²¹

This investigation of the literature found the remaining sources were from Army publications. Information sourced from issues of *The war cry* included; the June 1885 commencement;²² the McNaught letter to Booth in 1880;²³ and the commencement of 1883, led by the Harry family.²⁴ The only information not from *The war cry* was about Cairns' commencement in 1882, which came from the forerunner to the Army's year book, published in 1883.²⁵ Yet, Dale did change some information from these sources. For example, in one of *The war cry* reports, Edward wrote, "five Salvationists" attempted to commence the Army and later, "no fewer than four different batches had in turn endeavoured to establish Army work, and failed in the attempt."²⁶ Dale only stated three attempts, possibly because these were the only ones found in other Army publications.

The problems with most of the sources used by Dale are that they were written well after the events, focused on activities from June 1885 onwards, or written by people who were nowhere near Queensland before June 1885.

The official international history of The Salvation Army, already quoted, was published in 1950. Due to its brevity, little more information can be extracted, only that it would appear that Sandall borrowed from Dale's work.²⁷

Dale went on to publish, in 1952, a history of The Salvation Army in Australia. In relation to Queensland, the main body of the book included; "In June, 1885, after Soldiers had tried unsuccessfully to open fire at Brisbane, a party of four Officers was despatched from Melbourne to

¹⁹ "A Salvation 'free-and-easy'", *The Brisbane courier*, (Queensland, Monday 13 July 1885), 5.

²⁰ Dale, "Hectic opening days in Queensland", 16. Dale later placed this in his book as a direct quotation "hotter than Nebuchadnezzar's furnace". Dale, *Salvation Chariot*, 24 – 25.

²¹ See for example Clifford Hilton, "Through Three Generations: Historical high-lights and little known facts", *The war cry*, (Melbourne, Saturday 10 July 1965), 6.; Ken Sanz, "Nebuchadnezzar's Furnace – And the Beginnings of The Salvation Army in Queensland," read by Captain Bruce Buckmaster at the meeting of the Royal Historical Society of Queensland at Newstead House, 23 June, 1977, *Journal of the Royal Historical Society of Queensland*, (Brisbane: Vol. 10, Iss 2, 1977), 105 – 113.

²² The literature investigation found this information in two different articles by Ruben Edwards. In addition, information Edwards used was found in an earlier article in *The Brisbane courier*, which shows he used this information for some of his memories. As Trueman showed, it is not unusual for eyewitness accounts to be problematic. Ruben Edwards, "The Opening of Queensland", *The war cry*, (Melbourne, 9 July 1910), 7, 11.; Ruben Edwards, "Brisbane I. The premier corps of Queensland", *The victory*, (Melbourne, 2 August 1915), 306 – 308.; "A Salvation 'free-and-easy'", *The Brisbane courier*, (Queensland, Monday 13 July 1885), 5.; Margaret MacMillan, *The uses and abuses of history*, (London, UK: Profile Books, 2009), 44 – 49.; Carl R. Trueman, *Histories and fallacies. Problems faced in the writing of history*, (Wheaton, USA: Crossway, 2010), 34 – 39.

²³ This investigation found this information in *The war cry*. A. K. McNaught, "Australia. Another appeal.", *The war cry*, (London, Saturday 4 December 1880), 3.

²⁴ This investigation found the information in "Queensland Army pioneers", *The war cry*, (Melbourne, Saturday 27 June 1936), 15.

²⁵ William Booth, *The salvation war, 1883*, (London, UK: Salvation Army Book Depot, 1884), 83.; This investigation has also found the information in "Brisbane", *The war cry*, (Adelaide, 6 April 1883), 2.

²⁶ Edwards, "The Opening of Queensland", 7; Edwards, "Brisbane I. The premier corps of Queensland", 306.

²⁷ Sandall, *The history of The Salvation Army*, 2:249.

commence work in Queensland.”²⁸ In the appendix, Dale unpacked the Queensland commencement narrative;

SOLDIERS’ EFFORTS TO OPEN FIRE IN QUEENSLAND. - In 1880, A. K. McNaught, of Brisbane, wrote the Founder, seeking recognition and support. Two years later “an excellent Sheffield Soldier,” migrating to Queensland, was given Officer status. Captain Sutherland visited him in November 1882, and they rented the Temperance Hall for a period. Seeing no prospect of obtaining support for his wife and family, he sought employment at Ipswich, holding meetings in his own time. Reports signed “Captain and Lieutenant Cairns” appeared in the Melbourne War Cry, 1883.

In 1883, Salvationists from Torquay – Brother and Sister Harry – arrived in Queensland. Wearing S’s and Army shields, they took their stand boldly as they moved to various centres, following employment, and were subject to persecution before ultimately settling as Soldiers at Toowong.²⁹

There is no additional information in this appendix than that in Dale’s earlier articles, therefore the sources must have been as used previously. Although these “Soldiers” were named, they were quarantined to the appendix, and not further investigated.³⁰

The archives revealed an interesting change in Dale’s work. There is a series of papers which appear to be a draft of Dale’s 1947 article, with some editorial differences and a major change. In these documents it stated, “[i]n 1881 Brother and Sister Harry, Salvationists from Torquay, arrived.”³¹ As his published work stated 1883, this could mean there was either a typographic error in the two published works, or he had some questions over the claims in *The war cry* that the Harry couple arrived in 1881.³² Although Dale’s two published works stated the Harry family arrived in 1883, the archive document stated 1881; the archive document appears to have been used for the next round of articles as they all used the earlier date.

Although Dale changed some facts from the original sources without explanation, his work has been the foundation from which the Queensland commencement narrative has rested. Out of all the literature identified that was linked to this narrative, Dale’s works were the most in-depth.

The next series of articles to cover the Queensland commencement narrative appeared in 1955.³³ The first of these listed the Harry family arriving in 1881, as in Dale’s manuscript, and also stated that Cairns’ commencement occurred in 1882, as in Dale’s published works.³⁴ The two short paragraphs on work prior to June 1885 gave no additional information. Therefore, the sources used for this series was that of Dale’s works. The publication showed no investigation of primary sources.

Despite the information outlined by Dale, narratives were being published that were different from his work, and which appeared to be without research. On Sunday 4 September 1960 a “meeting of thanksgiving for eighty years of Salvation Army service in the Commonwealth” was held at the Brisbane City Temple. In the notes that were shared with the congregation, the Queensland commencement narrative was reduced to;

²⁸ Dale, *Salvation Chariot*, 24.

²⁹ Dale, *Salvation Chariot*, 149 – 150.

³⁰ Dale, *Salvation chariot*, 149 – 150.; Dale, “Hectic opening days in Queensland”, 16.

³¹ Letter from Percival Dale to Brisbane DHQ, Dale, “Hectic opening days in Queensland. Guerrilla Warfare – Fierce and unscrupulous”, (Brisbane, typed notes 22 February 1955).

³² See “Queensland Army pioneers”, *The war cry*, (Melbourne, Saturday 27 June 1936), 15.

³³ Anon, “How the Army came to Brisbane,” “Hall as hot as a furnace”, *The war cry*, (Melbourne, 27 August 1955), 2.; Anon, “How the Army came to Brisbane,” “2 – The musicians blossom out”, *The war cry*, (Melbourne, 3 September 1955), 2.

³⁴ Anon, “How the Army came to Brisbane”, 2.

The Army had a hot reception in Brisbane in 1885 in a tin shed shimmering in the tropical heat. This was the second attempt on the Northern State...³⁵

This commentary failed to list those who attempted the first commencement and when. Neither did it include speculation of the other attempts outlined by Dale. Although the “tin shed” was listed, its location was not, nor were the names of the earlier pioneers given.

In 1965, *The war cry* printed a small article by Clifford Hilton about the Queensland commencement narrative. Hilton included most of the letter found in the London issue of *The war cry* of 1880,³⁶ then wrote,

The General could not spare officers from England, and in other colonies of Australia officers recruited from the ranks were quickly absorbed in local pioneering. Therefore there was a delay of almost five years before an official party arrived to ‘open fire’ in Brisbane.³⁷

Although Dale stated that Cairns was a Captain, as did Hilton, Hilton must not have believed that Cairns was ‘official’ as there were five years between the McNaught attempt in 1880 and the Wright commencement in 1885, but fewer years between the McNaught and Cairns and then the Wright commencements. Hilton then went further and explained that, “the local enthusiasts tried to keep their banners flying, and although they had a measure of initial success, the work was not established”. How he knew of the “initial success” and subsequent failure was not discussed. Hilton listed Captain Cairns, a hall in Sandgate, and from *The Brisbane directory 1883 – 1884* a Salvation Army hall in Charlotte Street, but did not explain their links to the different attempts. The reference to *The Brisbane directory* was the first citing of a primary source in this body of literature. Hilton also quoted that this hall was “reputed to be ‘hotter than Nebuchadnezzar’s furnace’”,³⁸ which was a direct link to Dale’s work.³⁹

Just under a decade from Hilton’s work, appeared a more critical discussion by Leslie Rusher, again printed in *The war cry*. Rusher listed only two attempts to commence the Army in Queensland prior to June 1885, presumably the ones by McNaught and Cairns, yet neither name was used. These commencements received deep criticism. Rusher wrote;

Instead of “opening fire” in Queensland in 1883 as was planned, the Army “misfired” twice, with the result that the Army itself was casualty number one. The public also received injuries which took time to heal.⁴⁰

This statement appears to claim that both commencements were attempted in 1883, which is very different than other authors. Rusher claimed that a pre-existing mission was unsuccessful, so the leaders decided to grow their mission by using the name ‘Salvation Army’. Presumably this was in reference to the McNaught effort. Rusher wrote, they “thought they could do better as Salvationists” but he claimed their effort “was a disaster.” Rusher stated, the officers sent “were not pioneer material”, it is assumed that this reference is about Cairns. Therefore an officer, Captain Sutherland from Sydney was sent to Brisbane to train them, but this still was of no assistance as Cairns, “gave up and the fighting petered out”. All these statements were without reference and out of line with the other authors reviewed. Rusher also claimed that Sutherland came to Brisbane in December 1883,

³⁵ Anon, The program outline for “Meetings of thanksgiving”, (Brisbane, Sunday 4 September 1960), 2.

³⁶ McNaught, “Australia. Another appeal”, 3.

³⁷ Hilton, “Through three generations”, 6.

³⁸ Hilton, “Through three generations”, 6.

³⁹ Dale, “Hectic opening days in Queensland”, 16.

⁴⁰ Leslie Rusher, “As it was in the beginning: Part 7: In Queensland”, *The war cry*, (Melbourne, 7 August 1972), 2.

which is again out of line with other authors. No sources could be found to support Rusher's dates and claims.⁴¹

The next article identified was published in 1977 by Ken Sanz. Although the paper outlined the traditional Adelaide commencement narrative, he stated "Queensland was different".⁴² Sanz cited some of the contents of the letter that appeared in the London issue of *The war cry*, 1880,⁴³ however as with Hilton, Sanz attributed this to a Mr. A. K. McNaught, not to a couple as others had done. Also, like Hilton, Sanz stated that Booth could not spare officers to send to Queensland. Upon closer inspection it would appear that Sanz had not looked at the original documents, only the work of Hilton and others, as these are the works referenced. Therefore, Sanz made the same assumptions of previous authors.⁴⁴ The ways in which Sanz differs from Dale's work are he: excluded the Harry family commencement; and stated that Sutherland secured for Cairns, "a galvanised iron shed on the corner of Albert and Charlotte Street", not the Temperance Hall. Also differing from Dale, but in line with Rusher, Sanz stated that December 1883 was the date Captain Sutherland visited Cairns.⁴⁵

To commemorate the 1980 centenary of the Army's Adelaide commencement narrative, two books were published, and like Dale, they were more thematical than chronological. The first book by Tarling was a pictorial history of the movement, but did have four differences from Dale's work in relation to the Queensland narrative. First, there was, like Sanz, a question of the traditional belief that the Army commenced in Adelaide and spread throughout the continent. Tarling wrote;

Although Gore and Saunders are traditionally accredited with getting the Army under way in Australia, 1880 was a year of multiple births. Sydney, Melbourne and Brisbane all had sympathizers with the cause.⁴⁶

Second, Tarling had "Mr and Mrs A. D. McNaught" and not "A. K. McNaught" as Dale and the original letter in *The war cry*.⁴⁷ While this may simply be a typing error, it raises questions about the accuracy of the initial recording of the initials. He also linked the letter to a couple rather than a single person.⁴⁸ Third, like Dale and Rusher, Tarling acknowledged that the McNaughts had their own mission. Fourth, Tarling listed none of the other attempts to commence the Army in Brisbane outlined by Dale.⁴⁹

The second work published in 1980 was by Barbara Bolton.⁵⁰ She followed the ideas outlined by Dale but with the more negative discussion of outcomes similar to Rusher. After outlining the Adelaide commencement narrative, Bolton wrote;

William Booth was also receiving reports of Salvation Army beginnings in other parts of Australia. In Brisbane, a Mr and Mrs McNaught had begun a programme of street-meetings and

⁴¹ Rusher, "As it was in the beginning", 2.

⁴² Sanz, 'Nebuchadnezzar's Furnace', 106. Note that Sanz took Dale's changed title of an 1885 newspaper article to be the title for his own paper.

⁴³ McNaught, "Australia. Another appeal", 3.

⁴⁴ For example, the existence of the hall in Sandgate, the failure of the commencements prior to 1885 and that Captain Sutherland came to Brisbane in December 1883 to assist Cairns.

⁴⁵ Sanz, 'Nebuchadnezzar's Furnace', 106.

⁴⁶ Tarling, *Thank God for the Salvos*, 16. Tarling could have used some of Scotney's work as he also used the phrase "year of multiple births" as a heading for his paper. Scotney, "The Year of Multiple Births".

⁴⁷ McNaught, "Australia. Another appeal", 3.

⁴⁸ Tarling cited the issue of *The war cry* that carried the letter, where others did not. Tarling, *Thank God for the Salvos*, 16.

⁴⁹ Tarling, *Thank God for the Salvos*, 16.

⁵⁰ Bolton, *Booth's Drum*.

marches in “the worst part of the city” and McNaught urged Booth to send officers. ... But the Brisbane attempt collapsed...⁵¹

A slightly more extensive discussion on the Queensland commencement narrative was given later in Bolton’s book. It was first stressed that the Army was increasing greatly from the work in Adelaide.⁵² She saw the activities in Brisbane as a problem; “Brisbane presented challenges of its own...”. While it appears that Bolton relied extensively on Dale’s work, as Bolton listed the names of Mr and Mrs McNaught, Captain and Mrs Cairns and Brother and Sister Harry, her work had less information about the Queensland commencement narrative than Dale.⁵³

Bolton listed nothing of the McNaught Mission and stated that Cairns was commissioned and sent to Brisbane by William Booth in 1881. However, Dale had 1882 and others 1883. Also, maybe as Dale was not clear about the year of the Harry commencement, Bolton did not list a year. In addition to this, Bolton emphasised that these all failed: Mr and Mrs McNaught’s “efforts soon dwindled away”; Captain and Mrs Cairns were “untrained and inexperienced, [and] found it impossible to succeed”; and Brother and Sister Harry “were unable to form a nucleus of supporters – possibly because the search for employment kept them moving from town to town.” As with Rusher, Bolton claimed these “attempts” created cynicism with the Brisbane population as “[t]he city had too many beginnings”.⁵⁴

As with the other authors, Bolton gave no evidence for her claims, and the only positive thing she said about these events was, like Sandall and Dale, a building remained with the title “SALVATION ARMY” on the front. She then wrote that when the official party took this building in June 1885, they wrote the words “UNDER NEW MANAGEMENT” near the existing sign.⁵⁵ This was a direct reference to Edward’s reminiscence, who did not arrive in Brisbane until June 1885.⁵⁶

There has been recent research⁵⁷ that mentioned the Queensland commencement narrative, but only in passing. Cox focused on The Salvation Army’s social services on the Australian continent and included some information related to Queensland. Cox wrote,

In Queensland too, a group operated in accordance with the Salvation Army, but were associated with the Methodists for want of a more appropriate organisation in the Colony to attach themselves. A letter from the group to Salvation Army management, dated 4 October 1880, appealed to London to authorize the work and for an Officer to be sent to lead their evangelical mission work in Brisbane. The Queensland group offered to financially support and rally behind an Officer, if sent. However, the Adelaide group were in constant contact with London, with some of them being known Army converts ... Queensland would have to wait two years before London sent a group of three Officers, led by Captain P W Cairns, to take charge of the thriving Army there.⁵⁸

Cox however, does not give an argument or evidence for such a statement. Cox also was the kindest to the earlier work in Queensland as she later wrote,

⁵¹ Bolton, *Booth’s Drum*, 11 – 12.

⁵² Bolton, *Booth’s Drum*, 21.

⁵³ Bolton, *Booth’s Drum*, 22.

⁵⁴ Bolton, *Booth’s Drum*, 22.

⁵⁵ Bolton, *Booth’s Drum*, 22.

⁵⁶ Edwards, “The Opening of Queensland”, 7.

⁵⁷ It is acknowledged that Hein listed information on Queensland, that however: had errors, such as Mizpah was an Army collective farm, which it was not; used older sources with errors to refute new peer reviewed research; and used popular historic works when academic sources were available. Hein, Jennifer, ‘*Abominable yahoos*’.

⁵⁸ Cox, *Defining the war*, 54 - 65.

Whilst Adelaide was the chosen city due to the level of existing support offered, both moral and financial, Brisbane or Melbourne could have equally provided support for the Army's formal introduction to the colonies, due to comparable levels of existing unofficial activities in these cities.⁵⁹

Yet as with Sandall, Cox did not define 'official' and 'unofficial'.

Souvenir programs and artefacts

As there were only hints of information relating to The Salvation Army Queensland commencement narrative in the published history, the search for information was taken wider, to include artefacts. The preliminary search of archives found the major form of public history connected to this narrative were souvenir programs. These have reinforced the collective memory of the commencement narrative, but have not always been clear.⁶⁰

The first identified souvenir program was from 1935. It was full of errors.⁶¹ The program⁶² used a large section of a report that appeared in *The Brisbane courier* from July 1885.⁶³ This was the report later used by Dale and other authors. The program also included a memoir from Edwards, who it must be remembered did not arrive in Brisbane until June 1885. In the memoir, Edwards' only discussion on any work prior to his arrival was that the new arrivals did not know of the "previous un-official efforts both at Ipswich and Brisbane", and that each "effort ... dwindled away". He also wrote that the hall that remained from previous "efforts" was used by the new arrivals.⁶⁴ Nothing else was listed in the program about work prior to June 1885.

The remaining souvenir programs often had a similar narrative to that outlined by Dale, but again with differing dates. The 1955 souvenir program outlined the three commencements: by McNaught in 1880; by Harry in 1881; and by Cairns in 1882, with Sutherland's visit in November 1882.⁶⁵ The 1960 souvenir program copied the 1955 program word for word.⁶⁶ Without explanation, the 1965 souvenir program omitted the McNaught effort, only including the latter two, that "never lasted".⁶⁷

Two souvenir programs published for the centenary of the 1885 commencement included all three commencements outlined by Dale, but gave different years. Both had McNaught commencing

⁵⁹ While Cox included evidence for her statement on Melbourne, no evidence was given for her claims of Brisbane. Cox, *Defining the war*, 75.

⁶⁰ Ruben Edwards, "Unfurling the Army's flag in Queensland", in Anon, *Official souvenir and programme*, 9.

⁶¹ This program showed a list of "leaders of The Salvation Army in Australia". The names before 1884, Colonel and Mrs James Barker and Marshal and Mrs Ballington Booth had next to them "Prior to our work in Queensland". There are however two major problems with this list. First, although it listed Commissioner T. H. Howard taking leadership from 1884, he was not made leader until after Ballington Booth. Booth was leader of Australasia in April 1885 and remained in the position until sometime after the International Congress, May 1886. Therefore, Howard could not have been leader in 1884 as the list suggested. Second, as Booth married Maud Charlesworth mid-September 1886, she never set foot in Australia while Booth was in command, it is not correct that she also was listed as the leader. Booth-Tucker stated Ballington was appointed to Australia in 1884 and Howard appointed the following year, 1885. Larsson listed the dates while Booth-Tucker just stated "upon his return" from Australia. Booth-Tucker, *The life of Catherine Booth*, 2:336.; John Larsson, *Those incredible Booths: William and Catherine Booth as parents and the life stories of their eight children*, (London, UK: Salvation Book, The Salvation Army International Headquarters, 2015), 107 – 111.; Booth-Tucker, *William Booth*, 78.

⁶² "Crisp comments by 'The Courier', Fifty years ago", in Anon, *Official souvenir and programme*, 10.

⁶³ "A Salvation 'free-and-easy'", *The Brisbane courier*, (Queensland, Monday 13 July 1885), 5.

⁶⁴ Edwards, "Unfurling the Army's flag in Queensland", 9.

⁶⁵ Anon, *Brisbane City Temple – 70th anniversary*, (Brisbane: The Salvation Army, 1955), 8.

⁶⁶ Anon, *The Salvation Army 75th anniversary Brisbane City Temple Corps, 1885-1960*, (Brisbane: The Salvation Army, 1960), 2.

⁶⁷ Anon, *80th corps anniversary and centenary celebration*, (Brisbane: The Salvation Army, 1965), 2.

work in 1880. Cairns was listed as commencing in 1881 and still working in 1883 in one publication, while the other stated Cairns commenced in 1882. Harry was stated as commencing the work in 1881 in one souvenir program and 1883 in the other.⁶⁸

After the publication of *Queensland centenary territorial congress program* in 1985, a series of letters from Major T. Hubbard was sent to Commissioner Harry Reed, correcting errors Hubbard believed existed. The first letter outlined a number of errors which included the rank of Wright, who was the leading officer of the June 1885 commencement, and the chronology of the commencement of corps. Hubbard also listed a number of ideas that are not included in any other works. He claimed that the sign on the building read “Salvation Army Barracks” not just “Salvation Army”, that there were commencements in 1880, 1883 and 1884, and that McNaught built the tin shed in 1876. In the second letter, Hubbard reiterated the points from the first letter, but included that yet another attempt to commence the work occurred in early 1885. Again, there was no references for these claims.⁶⁹

Concluding remarks and gaps in the literature

There are many gaps, many assumptions that need to be challenged and many unanswered questions in the literature relating to The Salvation Army Queensland commencement narrative.

Dale and Hilton appeared to be the only authors who searched for information on the narrative outside Salvation Army sources, which Gordon Moyles and Hein argue has often been a failure of Army history.⁷⁰ Such sources were not verified and therefore could contain biases or errors.⁷¹ To this point must be added that Hilton was the only author to include a non-Army source in existence prior to June 1885, to collaborate the information of previous authors.

It could easily be stated that the wider story has been under-explored. It is clear that authors have used information from previous works and allowed error and assumption to creep into the narrative without question. However, deeper analysis is needed to outline the specific gaps.

The first gap is the missing information on the time leading up to each attempt to commence the Army in Queensland. The narrative failed to identify the earlier pioneer’s connection to the Army, how they secured the “tin shed”, or if each attempt knew of or built upon the earlier attempts.

The second gap is that there is no discussion as to why the people listed decided to attempt to commence the Army in Queensland. There is no information on the motivating factors of each attempt, or why they chose the Army and not another Christian body.

There is also no investigation into the societal or religious context of the time, which would be the third gap. Such investigation would give a clearer insight into the timeline of events. It could have also identified wider forces on such attempts and given some information for why they succeeded for a time and then failed.

⁶⁸ Anon, *The Salvation Army Brisbane City Temple Corps centenary 1885 – 1985*, (Brisbane: Brisbane City Temple, 1985), 14. Anon, *Queensland centenary territorial congress program*, (Brisbane: The Salvation Army Australia Eastern Territory, 1985), 18.

⁶⁹ Letter from Tom Hubbard to Harry Reed, (Sydney: 27 May 1985).; Personal communication from Tom Hubbard to the editor of *The war cry*, (Sydney: 30 May 1985).; Personal communication from Tom Hubbard to Harry Reed, (Sydney: 31 May 1985).

⁷⁰ R. G. Moyles, *Exploring Salvation Army history: Essays of discovery*, (Edmonton, Canada: AGM Publications, 2009), 87.; R. G. Moyles, *Across an ocean and a continent: The Salvation Army as a Canadian immigration agency 1904 – 1932*, (Toronto, Canada: Triumph Publishing, Canada and Bermuda Territory, 2018), 148 – 149.; Hein, ‘Abominable yahoos’, 42.

⁷¹ See discussion by Nelson who showed that both the sources’ and the historians’ biases need to be identified and that modern historians need to move away from just religious sources and include secular sources to identify biases. Richard D. Nelson, *The historical books: Interpreting biblical texts series*, (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1998), 20.

A number of authors claimed that the attempts succeeded for a time, however there was no discussion on the ministries conducted by these people. This is the fourth gap, the non-inclusion of activities and ministries of efforts prior to June 1885, and no discussion on what success looked like. Such an investigation could identify if the attempts were ‘Salvation Army’ in name only, or if the worship style, beliefs and ministries were similar to those of Salvationists in other locations at the time. Bolton was the only author to state a “programme of street-meetings and marches in ‘the worst part of the city’”⁷² was used by the first group. However, the title, ‘Salvation Army’ and street-meetings and marches is not enough to claim connection to the Army, as other Christian bodies such as, the Hallelujah Band, City Missions, the Blue Ribbon Army and the Primitive Methodists were also using similar programs at the time.

Then, the fifth gap is the under-explored reasons why the attempts did not succeed. Although most authors did not give a reason for the failure of the attempts, others listed reasons that included lack of financial support,⁷³ lack of training, or the people were not pioneers.⁷⁴ However, other Salvationists at this time were untrained and lacked financial support, yet became leaders and pioneers of the work in other colonies and countries. Therefore, these assumptions alone cannot explain why the attempts failed.

The sixth gap is that similar to the criticism of the wider Australian commencement narrative of The Salvation Army. As the wider narrative is Adelaide centric, so too the Queensland commencement narrative is Brisbane centric. While Dale stated Cairns went to Ipswich,⁷⁵ Dale and Bolton claimed Harry travelled to different centres in Queensland,⁷⁶ Hilton claimed there was a hall in Sandgate,⁷⁷ and Edwards stated there was an unofficial attempt at Ipswich,⁷⁸ none of the places outside of Brisbane are discussed.

The seventh gap is the claim that such failed attempts had a negative impact on The Salvation Army, but this is not explored in any depth. If this was the case, such a fact could have also impacted earlier attempts, not just the June 1885 attempt. There is no real investigation of the public’s perception of The Salvation Army in Queensland at this time. The authors of the Queensland narrative neglect to state that the Army in other places around the world was having a similar difficult time.⁷⁹

Finally, a gap one step removed from the narrative is that although there are names of people who made the attempts to commence the Army in Queensland, sources, such as newspapers and directories and the building, the “tin shed”, there has been no research on The Salvation Army Queensland commencement narrative. There is no discussion as to why a previous attempt to investigate this narrative has not been undertaken.

The literature connected to The Salvation Army Queensland commencement narrative is full of gaps, conflicting information and unsupported assumptions. This investigation of literature found no research into the people or events of the narrative. For these reasons, research is needed on the events and the people associated with events prior to June 1885.

⁷² Bolton, *Booth’s Drum*, 11 – 12.

⁷³ Dale, *Salvation Chariot*, 149 – 150.; Bolton, *Booth’s Drum*, 22.

⁷⁴ Rusher, “As it was in the beginning”, 2.; Bolton, *Booth’s Drum*, 22.

⁷⁵ Dale, *Salvation Chariot*, 149 – 150.

⁷⁶ Dale, *Salvation Chariot*, 149 – 150.; Bolton, *Booth’s Drum*, 22.

⁷⁷ Hilton, “Through three generations”, 6.

⁷⁸ Edwards, “Unfurling the Army’s flag in Queensland”, 9.

⁷⁹ See Nigel Bovey, *Blood on the flag*, (London, UK: Shield Books, The Salvation Army United Kingdom Territory, 2015), “Chapter 29, 1885-86: Battles”, 309 – 315.